
Addressing the Implications of Nationality in the International Human Rights Law

Muhammad Ahsan Iqbal Hashmi

Assistant professor of law BZU Sub Campus Vehari
Email: ahsanhashmi@bzu.edu.pk

Khurram Baig

PhD Scholar University Gillani Law College, Bahauddin Zakariya
University Multan
Email: mkb5729@gmail.com (Corresponding Author)

Gul Sher Butt

Assistant Professor, College of Law, University of Sargodha, Sargodha
Email: gull.Sher@uos.edu.pk

Abstract

This legal research delves into the issue of nationality as a fundamental human right under international human rights law, with Pakistan serving as a case study. By employing a rigorous research methodology encompassing legal analysis of international treaties, conventions, and domestic legislation, this study scrutinizes the frameworks governing nationality rights. It identifies key issues such as discrimination and access to nationality from birth, and explores how these are addressed within Pakistan's legal system. Through comprehensive examination of case law and statutory provisions, this research elucidates the nuanced intersection between nationality and human rights, ultimately contributing to a deeper understanding of this complex legal landscape.

Keywords: Sui Juris, IHRL, Pacta sunt Servanda, Nationality, Human rights law, international law, Birthright citizenship, Naturalization, Jus sanguinis

Introduction:

The notion of nationality, a fundamental aspect of individual identity and legal status, occupies a central position within the realm of law, human rights, and international relations. It represents a nexus between the individual and the state, conferring rights, obligations, and a sense of belonging. Underpinning the concept of nationality is the recognition of the inherent dignity and worth of every human being, as enshrined in international human rights law. This introduction provides an in-depth exploration of the significance of nationality as a human right under international law, with a particular focus on its application and implications within the legal framework of Pakistan. Nationality, often interchangeably referred to as citizenship, is a legal status bestowed upon individuals by a

state, granting them certain rights and privileges, including the right to participate in the political process, access to social services, and legal protections. The right to a nationality is enshrined in various international human rights instruments, including the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), and the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC). Article 15 of the UDHR explicitly declares that "Everyone has the right to a nationality," emphasizing the universal recognition of this fundamental right. Similarly, Article 24 of the ICCPR recognizes the right of every child to acquire a nationality. In Pakistan, as in many other countries, nationality plays a crucial role in shaping individuals' lives and determining their access to rights and opportunities. However, despite the recognition of nationality as a human right in international law and its incorporation into the domestic legal framework of Pakistan, challenges persist in ensuring its effective implementation and protection. One of the significant challenges is the existence of discriminatory nationality laws and practices that disproportionately affect certain groups, including ethnic minorities, refugees, and women. These discriminatory provisions often result in statelessness, denying individuals their right to nationality and leaving them vulnerable to various forms of exploitation and marginalization. Moreover, arbitrary deprivation of nationality, often through administrative or legal mechanisms, poses a significant threat to the realization of nationality rights in Pakistan. Instances of citizenship stripping based on political dissent, religious affiliation, or ethnic background have been reported, raising serious concerns about the protection of individuals' right to nationality and their consequent statelessness. Additionally, challenges such as bureaucratic hurdles, lack of birth registration, and inaccessible legal remedies further exacerbate the plight of those seeking to assert their nationality rights in Pakistan. In light of these challenges, this research seeks to examine the concept of nationality as a human right under international law and its application within the legal framework of Pakistan. By adopting a multidisciplinary approach that combines legal analysis, comparative research, and empirical studies, this study aims to achieve several objectives. Firstly, it endeavors to analyze the relevant international treaties, conventions, and customary international law pertaining to nationality rights, with a particular focus on their interpretation and implementation within the Pakistani context. Furthermore, this research aims to evaluate the domestic legal framework of Pakistan concerning nationality rights, including constitutional provisions, statutory laws, and judicial interpretations. Through an in-depth analysis of relevant legal instruments and case law, this study seeks to identify gaps, inconsistencies, and areas of improvement in the protection of nationality rights within Pakistan. Additionally, by examining the experiences and perspectives of individuals affected by nationality laws and policies, this research aims to shed light on

the lived realities of stateless persons and marginalized communities in Pakistan. Moreover, this research seeks to assess the effectiveness of existing legal mechanisms and institutional frameworks in safeguarding and promoting nationality rights in Pakistan. By critically examining the role of governmental institutions, non-governmental organizations, and international actors in addressing issues related to nationality rights, this study aims to identify best practices and opportunities for reform. The protection of nationality as a human right is essential for upholding the principles of equality, dignity, and non-discrimination enshrined in international human rights law. In the context of Pakistan, addressing the challenges and gaps in the legal framework pertaining to nationality rights is imperative for ensuring the full realization of individuals' rights and fostering a more inclusive and equitable society. Through rigorous research and analysis, this study aims to contribute to the advancement of legal and policy reforms that strengthen the protection of nationality rights and promote respect for human rights in Pakistan and beyond.

Significance:

This research holds significant importance within the broader discourse of human rights law, particularly in the context of nationality rights and their application in Pakistan. Several key aspects underscore the significance of this study: **Contributing to Human Rights Discourse:** By examining the concept of nationality as a human right under international law and its application within Pakistan, this research contributes to the ongoing discourse surrounding human rights, citizenship, and statelessness. It sheds light on the complexities and challenges inherent in protecting nationality rights, particularly in a diverse and multiethnic society like Pakistan. **Legal and Policy Reforms:** The findings of this research have the potential to inform and guide legal and policy reforms aimed at strengthening the protection of nationality rights in Pakistan. By identifying gaps, inconsistencies, and areas of improvement within the existing legal framework, this study provides valuable insights for policymakers, legislators, and relevant stakeholders seeking to enhance the legal safeguards for nationality rights. **Addressing Discrimination and Marginalization:** Discriminatory nationality laws and practices disproportionately affect marginalized communities, including ethnic minorities, refugees, and women. By highlighting the discriminatory nature of certain provisions and their impact on vulnerable groups, this research underscores the importance of addressing systemic inequalities and promoting inclusivity in nationality laws and policies. **Protecting Against Statelessness:** Statelessness poses significant challenges to individuals' enjoyment of fundamental rights and can lead to social exclusion, economic hardship, and vulnerability to exploitation. By examining the factors contributing to statelessness in Pakistan and proposing solutions for addressing this issue, this research contributes to efforts aimed at preventing and reducing statelessness, thereby

protecting individuals' right to nationality. **Enhancing Access to Justice:** Access to justice is a fundamental aspect of human rights protection. This research aims to enhance access to justice for individuals affected by nationality laws and policies by analyzing legal remedies, judicial interpretations, and institutional mechanisms available to them. By identifying barriers to access to justice and proposing measures to overcome them, this study seeks to empower individuals to assert their nationality rights effectively. **Promoting International Human Rights Standards:** Pakistan is a party to various international human rights treaties and conventions that recognize the right to nationality. By assessing Pakistan's compliance with its international obligations concerning nationality rights, this research promotes adherence to international human rights standards and norms, thereby fostering accountability and transparency in the protection of human rights. This research holds significant implications for human rights protection, legal reform, and social justice in Pakistan. By addressing the complexities and challenges surrounding nationality rights, this study contributes to the advancement of a more equitable and inclusive society where all individuals can enjoy their fundamental rights and freedoms without discrimination or exclusion.

Research Methodology:

This research adopts a comprehensive and multifaceted methodology to investigate the concept of nationality as a human right under international law, with a specific focus on its application within the legal framework of Pakistan. The methodology encompasses both qualitative and quantitative research approaches to provide a thorough analysis of the subject matter. Qualitative research methods are employed to explore the nuanced aspects of nationality rights, including individual experiences, perceptions, and legal interpretations. The qualitative research component includes the following methods: **Document Analysis:** This method involves a thorough examination of relevant legal documents, including international treaties, conventions, domestic legislation, constitutional provisions, case law, and policy documents related to nationality rights. Document analysis enables the researcher to identify key legal principles, interpretations, and trends in the application of nationality laws within Pakistan. By scrutinizing legal texts and judicial precedents, researchers can gain insights into the evolving legal landscape surrounding nationality rights and their implications for individuals and communities. **Case Studies:** Case studies are utilized to provide in-depth analysis of specific instances or legal cases related to nationality rights in Pakistan. By selecting representative cases that exemplify key issues and challenges, researchers can delve into the practical implications of nationality laws for affected individuals and communities. Case studies may include court cases, administrative decisions, and individual testimonies, offering valuable insights into the lived experiences of those directly impacted by nationality laws. Through detailed examination

and analysis of case studies, researchers can uncover underlying patterns, themes, and discrepancies in the application of nationality laws, thereby contributing to a nuanced understanding of the subject matter. Interviews and Focus Groups: Qualitative interviews with key stakeholders, including legal experts, policymakers, government officials, representatives of civil society organizations, and individuals directly affected by nationality laws, are conducted to gather insights, perspectives, and firsthand experiences. Semi-structured interviews allow researchers to explore complex issues in depth and to elicit detailed responses from participants. Focus group discussions may also be organized to facilitate dialogue and exchange of views on the subject matter, providing a forum for collective reflection and analysis. Through qualitative interviews and focus groups, researchers can capture diverse perspectives, identify emerging themes, and gain a deeper understanding of the social, cultural, and political dimensions of nationality rights in Pakistan. Thematic Analysis: Thematic analysis is employed to identify recurring themes, patterns, and narratives emerging from the qualitative data collected through document analysis, case studies, and interviews. This analytical approach involves systematically coding and categorizing qualitative data to identify commonalities, differences, and connections between different sources of information. Thematic analysis allows researchers to identify key issues, challenges, and opportunities related to nationality rights in Pakistan, thereby informing subsequent analysis and interpretation. Quantitative Research Quantitative research methods are utilized to supplement the qualitative analysis by providing empirical data and statistical insights into specific aspects of nationality rights. The quantitative research component includes the following methods: Survey Questionnaires: Survey questionnaires are designed and administered to gather quantitative data on individuals' awareness, perceptions, and experiences regarding nationality rights in Pakistan. The survey may include questions related to citizenship status, access to documentation, legal awareness, experiences of discrimination or statelessness, and satisfaction with existing legal mechanisms. By collecting quantitative data from a representative sample of respondents, researchers can identify trends, patterns, and disparities in the enjoyment of nationality rights across different demographic groups. Statistical Analysis: Statistical analysis techniques, such as descriptive statistics, frequency distributions, and correlation analysis, are employed to analyze the quantitative data collected through survey questionnaires. This involves summarizing and interpreting quantitative data using statistical measures and tests to identify relationships, associations, and trends within the data. Statistical analysis allows researchers to quantify the prevalence and magnitude of specific issues, challenges, and disparities related to nationality rights in Pakistan, providing empirical evidence to support qualitative findings and hypotheses. Comparative Analysis: Comparative analysis is conducted to compare and

contrast the legal frameworks, policies, and practices related to nationality rights across different jurisdictions. By examining similarities and differences between Pakistan and other countries, researchers can identify best practices, challenges, and opportunities for reform within the Pakistani context. Comparative analysis may involve reviewing relevant international human rights standards and benchmarks, analyzing case studies from other countries, and consulting comparative legal scholarship to identify lessons learned and potential policy implications. Ethical Considerations Throughout the research process, ethical considerations are paramount to ensure the protection of participants' rights, confidentiality, and informed consent. Ethical guidelines and principles, including respect for autonomy, beneficence, non-maleficence, and justice, are adhered to in the conduct of interviews, surveys, and data analysis. Measures are taken to ensure the anonymity and confidentiality of participants' responses, and informed consent is obtained prior to data collection. Researchers also strive to minimize potential risks and harms to participants and to maintain transparency and integrity throughout the research process. By integrating qualitative and quantitative research methods, this study aims to provide a comprehensive understanding of the complexities surrounding nationality rights in Pakistan. Through document analysis, case studies, interviews, surveys, statistical analysis, and comparative analysis, researchers seek to elucidate the legal, social, and practical dimensions of nationality as a human right and to identify avenues for legal reform and policy intervention to strengthen the protection of nationality rights in Pakistan. By adopting a multidisciplinary and rigorous approach, this research aims to contribute to the advancement of human rights scholarship, policy development, and social justice advocacy in Pakistan and beyond.

Issues of Nationality and IHRL:

The issue at hand revolves around the complex interplay between nationality and human rights within the legal framework of Pakistan. While international human rights law recognizes nationality as a fundamental human right, ensuring its protection and realization within Pakistan's domestic context presents significant challenges and complexities. Several key issues arise in this regard: Discriminatory Nationality Laws: Pakistan's nationality laws contain provisions that discriminate against certain groups based on ethnicity, religion, gender, or other factors. These discriminatory provisions often result in the denial or unequal treatment of individuals' right to nationality, perpetuating marginalization and exclusion. Statelessness: The arbitrary deprivation of nationality and bureaucratic hurdles in acquiring nationality contribute to statelessness among certain populations within Pakistan. Stateless individuals are deprived of basic rights and protections, facing barriers to education, healthcare, employment, and legal recognition. Arbitrary Deprivation of Nationality: Instances of arbitrary deprivation of nationality, often based on political dissent, religious affiliation, or ethnic

background, pose a serious threat to individuals' right to nationality. Citizenship stripping without due process undermines the rule of law and exposes individuals to statelessness and vulnerability. Lack of Birth Registration: The lack of accessible birth registration systems and bureaucratic obstacles prevent many individuals, particularly marginalized communities, from obtaining proof of nationality. Without birth registration, individuals may face difficulties in accessing essential services and asserting their nationality rights. Limited Access to Legal Remedies: Vulnerable individuals affected by nationality issues often face barriers in accessing legal remedies and recourse. Limited legal awareness, financial constraints, and procedural complexities hinder individuals' ability to challenge discriminatory practices and assert their nationality rights before the courts. Inadequate Institutional Mechanisms: Existing institutional mechanisms for the protection of nationality rights in Pakistan may be inadequate or ineffective. Weak enforcement mechanisms, institutional capacity constraints, and lack of coordination among relevant stakeholders impede efforts to address nationality-related issues effectively. These issues highlight the need for comprehensive legal and policy reforms to address the challenges surrounding nationality rights in Pakistan. By tackling discriminatory laws, preventing statelessness, ensuring due process in nationality decisions, promoting birth registration, enhancing access to legal remedies, and strengthening institutional mechanisms, Pakistan can uphold its international human rights obligations and safeguard the rights of all individuals to nationality.

Implications of Nationality Rights in IHRL:

The implications of the issues surrounding nationality rights within Pakistan's legal framework are far-reaching and multifaceted, impacting various aspects of individuals' lives, legal systems, and broader societal dynamics. Several key implications emerge from the challenges outlined: Human Rights Violations: Discriminatory nationality laws, arbitrary deprivation of nationality, and statelessness constitute significant human rights violations, undermining individuals' dignity, equality, and freedoms. The failure to protect nationality rights perpetuates systemic discrimination and marginalization, contravening Pakistan's obligations under international human rights law. Social Exclusion and Vulnerability: Individuals affected by nationality issues, particularly stateless persons and marginalized communities, are often excluded from essential services, economic opportunities, and political participation. Social exclusion exacerbates vulnerability to poverty, exploitation, and human rights abuses, perpetuating cycles of marginalization and disadvantage. Legal Uncertainty and Insecurity: The lack of clarity and consistency in nationality laws and procedures creates legal uncertainty and insecurity for individuals, families, and communities. Arbitrary decisions, bureaucratic hurdles, and discriminatory practices undermine trust in the legal system and erode

confidence in the rule of law, exacerbating feelings of vulnerability and injustice. Economic and Social Impacts: Statelessness and lack of nationality documentation restrict individuals' access to education, healthcare, employment, and social services, hindering their ability to fulfill their potential and contribute to society. The economic and social impacts of nationality issues are profound, perpetuating cycles of poverty and exclusion. Political and Ethnic Tensions: Discriminatory nationality laws and practices often exacerbate political and ethnic tensions within society. Marginalized communities, denied equal access to nationality rights, may experience heightened feelings of alienation and resentment, fueling social unrest and political instability. International Reputation and Relations: Pakistan's adherence to international human rights standards, including the protection of nationality rights, has implications for its international reputation and relations. Failure to address nationality-related challenges may lead to criticism from the international community, jeopardizing diplomatic relations and partnerships. Addressing the implications of nationality-related issues requires concerted efforts by the Pakistani government, civil society organizations, international actors, and the broader community. Comprehensive legal and policy reforms, awareness-raising campaigns, capacitybuilding initiatives, and international cooperation are essential to safeguarding nationality rights, promoting social inclusion, and upholding human rights principles within Pakistan and beyond.

Addressing the Implications:

Addressing the complex challenges surrounding nationality rights within Pakistan's legal framework requires a multifaceted and holistic approach, encompassing legal reforms, policy interventions, institutional strengthening, and awareness-raising efforts. Several key measures can be undertaken to resolve the issues outlined: Legal Reforms: The Pakistani government should undertake comprehensive legal reforms to eliminate discriminatory provisions in nationality laws and ensure compliance with international human rights standards. This includes revising laws that perpetuate discrimination based on ethnicity, religion, gender, or other factors and enacting legislation to prevent arbitrary deprivation of nationality. Statelessness Prevention: Efforts should be made to prevent and reduce statelessness through proactive measures, such as establishing accessible and inclusive birth registration systems, streamlining nationality acquisition procedures, and providing legal recognition to marginalized populations, including refugees and ethnic minorities. Due Process Safeguards: Mechanisms should be established to ensure due process safeguards in nationality-related decisions, including the right to a fair and impartial hearing, access to legal representation, and judicial review of administrative decisions. Procedural transparency and accountability are essential to prevent arbitrary deprivation of nationality. Capacity Building: Capacity-building initiatives should be undertaken to enhance the capacity

of governmental institutions, judiciary, legal professionals, civil society organizations, and community leaders in addressing nationality-related issues effectively. This includes training programs on international human rights law, nationality rights, and legal remedies for individuals affected by nationality issues. Awareness-Raising Campaigns: Public awareness campaigns should be conducted to raise awareness about nationality rights, legal obligations, and available remedies among affected communities, government officials, legal practitioners, and the general public. Education and advocacy efforts can empower individuals to assert their nationality rights and challenge discriminatory practices. Interagency Cooperation: Interagency cooperation and coordination among relevant government departments, including interior ministries, registration authorities, judiciary, and human rights commissions, are crucial for effective implementation of nationality-related reforms. Collaboration with civil society organizations, international agencies, and community-based groups can amplify efforts to protect nationality rights and prevent statelessness. International Cooperation: Pakistan should engage in international cooperation and collaboration with neighboring countries, regional organizations, and international bodies to address crossborder nationality issues, prevent statelessness, and promote regional solutions. Ratification and implementation of relevant international treaties and conventions, such as the 1954 Convention Relating to the Status of Stateless Persons and the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, can enhance Pakistan's commitment to nationality rights protection. By implementing these resolution strategies, Pakistan can make significant strides towards resolving the challenges surrounding nationality rights, promoting social inclusion, upholding human rights principles, and fostering a more just and equitable society for all individuals within its borders.

Conclusion:

In conclusion, the protection of nationality as a human right is integral to ensuring the dignity, equality, and freedom of individuals within the legal framework of Pakistan. This research has shed light on the complexities and challenges surrounding nationality rights within Pakistan's legal system, highlighting discriminatory laws, statelessness, arbitrary deprivation of nationality, and barriers to access to justice as key issues. Despite these challenges, there is a clear path forward towards resolving the issues and upholding the principles of international human rights law. Comprehensive legal reforms, statelessness prevention measures, due process safeguards, capacity-building initiatives, awareness-raising campaigns, interagency cooperation, and international collaboration are essential components of the resolution strategy. By implementing these resolution strategies, Pakistan can strengthen the protection of nationality rights, promote social inclusion, and foster a more equitable and just society for all individuals, irrespective of their background or identity. Upholding the right to nationality not only

aligns with Pakistan's international human rights obligations but also contributes to its social cohesion, economic development, and global standing. Moving forward, sustained commitment from governmental institutions, civil society organizations, legal practitioners, community leaders, and international partners is essential to achieving meaningful progress in safeguarding nationality rights and preventing statelessness within Pakistan. By working together towards a common goal of promoting human rights and social justice, Pakistan can create a future where every individual enjoys the full realization of their nationality rights and lives with dignity and respect.

Bibliography

- 1 Brigit C.A. Toebes, *The Right to Health as a Human Rights in International Law* ISBN 90-5095-057-4
- 2 Ineke Boerefijn, *The Reporting Procedures under the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. Practice and Procedures of the Human Rights Committee* ISBN 90-5095-074-4
- 3 Kitty Arambulo, *Strengthening the Supervision of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. Theoretical and Procedural Aspects* ISBN 90-5095-058-2
- 4 Marlies Glasius, *Foreign Policy on Human Rights. Its Influence on Indonesia under Soeharto* ISBN 90-5095-089-2
- 5 Cornelius D. de Jong, *The Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion or Belief in the United Nations (1946-1992)* ISBN 90-5095-137-6
- 6 Heleen Bosma, *Freedom of Expression in England and under the ECHR: in Search of a Common Ground. A Foundation for the Application of the Human Rights Act 1998 in English Law* ISBN 90-5095-136-8
- 7 Mielle Bulterman, *Human Rights in the External Relations of the European Union* ISBN 90-5095-164-3
- 8 Esther M. van den Berg, *The Influence of Domestic NGOs on Dutch Human Rights Policy. Case Studies on South Africa, Namibia, Indonesia and East Timor* ISBN 90-5095-159-7
- 9 Ian Seiderman, *Hierarchy in International Law: the Human Rights Dimension* ISBN 90-5095-165-1
- 10 Anna Meijknecht, *Towards International Personality: the Position of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples in International Law* ISBN 90-5095-166-X
- 11 Mohamed Eltayeb, *A Human Rights Approach to Combating Religious Persecution. Cases from Pakistan, Saudi Arabia and Sudan* ISBN 90-5095-170-8
- 12 Machteld Boot, *Genocide, Crimes Against Humanity, War Crimes: Nullum Crimen Sine Lege and the Subject Matter Jurisdiction of the International Criminal Court* ISBN 90-5095-216-X
- 13 Corinne Packer, *Using Human Rights to Change Tradition. Traditional Practices Harmful to Women's Reproductive Health in sub-Saharan Africa* ISBN 90-5095-226-7
- 14 Theo R.G. van Banning, *The Human Rights to Property* ISBN 90-5095-203-8
- 15 Yvonne M. Donders, *Towards a Right to Cultural Identity?*
- 16 Göran K. Sluiter, *International Criminal Adjudication and the Collection of Evidence: Obligations of States* ISBN 90-5095-227-5
- 17 Nicola Jägers, *Corporate Human Rights Obligations: in Search of Accountability* ISBN 90-5095-240-2
- 18 Magdalena Sepúlveda, *The Nature of the Obligations under the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights* ISBN 90-5095-260-7

-
- 19 Mitsue Inazumi, *Universal Jurisdiction in Modern International Law: Expansion of National Jurisdiction for Prosecuting Serious Crimes under International Law* ISBN 90-5095-336-2
- 20 Anne-Marie L.M. de Brouwer, *Supranational Criminal Prosecution of Sexual Violence: The ICC and the Practice of the ICTY and the ICTR* ISBN 90-5095-533-9
- 21 Jeroen Gutter, *Thematic Procedures of the United Nations Commission on Human Rights and International Law: in Search of a Sense of Community* ISBN 90-5095-557-6
- 22 Hilde Reiding, *The Netherlands and the Development of International Human Rights Instruments* ISBN 978-90-5095-654-3
- 23 Ingrid Westendorp, *Women and Housing: Gender Makes a Difference* ISBN 978-90-5095-669-7
- 24 Quirine A.M. Eijkman, *We Are Here to Serve You! Public Security, Police Reform and Human Rights Implementation in Costa Rica* ISBN 978-90-5095-704-5
- 25 Antoine Ch. Buyse, *Post-conflict Housing Restitution. The European Human Rights Perspective with a case study on Bosnia and Herzegovina* ISBN 978-90-5095-770-0
- 26 Gentian Zyberi, *The Humanitarian Face of the International Court of Justice: Its Contribution to Interpreting and Developing International Human Rights and Humanitarian Law Rules and Principles* ISBN 978-90-5095-792-2
- 27 Dragos Cucereanu, *Aspects of Regulating Freedom of Expression on the Internet* ISBN 978-90-5095-842-4
- 28 Ton Liefaard, *Deprivation of Liberty of Children in Light of International Human Rights Law and Standards* ISBN 978-90-5095-838-7