

Exploring Honor Killings in Bagnari: Patriarchy, Politics or Traditional Practice

Mehrullah

Research Scholar at Government College University Lahore
mehrullahbro123@gmail.com

Inzamam Ellahi

Research Scholar at Government College University Lahore
inzimugheri@gmail.com

Ayesha Farooq

Associate Professor at Government College University Lahore
ishafraq@gmail.com

Abstract

In Baluchistan, a major portion of the population resides in rural areas, where cultural values and social norms are deeply ingrained. The people live in tribal structures, adhering to centuries-old traditions and a primitive code of conduct for everyday life. In terms of gender roles, women are regarded as the focal point of men's honor. Anything relating to women is considered a matter of honor and they are expected to refrain from such behaviors that are thought to bring "shame" to the family. In addition, feudal structure, tribal politics, and economic motives also play a part in accusing women of being Kari (a black woman). This thesis explores honor killings in relation to cultural background, feudal system, and economic and tribal politics in Bagnari (the universe of this research). However, this research was carried out based on interviews conducted with a small sample of university students. The findings revealed that the patriarchal system, tribal politics, and lack of jurisdictions play a vital role in honor killing. Further, the recommendations are stated which can be helpful to eradicate this social issue which are by limiting feudal lords' power and their influence in state institutions, particularly law enforcement, by promoting education that challenges the community's patriarchal and feudal mindset, and by strengthening the state institutions.

Keywords: Honour Killings, Bhangnari, Patriarchy, Jirga system, Traditional norms

INTRODUCTION

According to the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), at least 5000 women and girls are murdered yearly in the name of honour (United Nations Population Fund, 2000). However, many women have been killed throughout the Middle East and South Asia, while experts claim that these

estimates are inaccurate and that the number of victims is at least four times higher (Fisk, 2010). Homicides of women and girls for the sake of honour by male family members or community members are no longer restricted to national borders. Mayell (2002) states that it is not geographically limited but happening worldwide. Although some areas are particularly hard hit, such as South Asia and the Middle East (United Nations Population Fund, 2000). Pakistan is considerably apparent in the South Asian area for violence against women, and honour killing (HK) has become a widespread practice. According to a census, Pakistan is ranked third among the world's most dangerous nations for women (Thomson Reuters Foundation Trust, 2011). Every year, 1000 females become victims of honour killings in Pakistan (Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, 2012).

In Pakistan, at least 913 women were murdered in the name of honour in 2012, estimating seventeen honour killings per week (HRCF, 2013). In 2011, 943 honour killings were reported (HRCF, 2012). According to a non-governmental organisation, 187 women were killed in Pakistan's Baluchistan province in 2014 under the shadow of "honour" and "domestic violence" (Aurat Foundation, 2014). According to the 2013 report, 151 women were murdered in Baluchistan in 2013 in the name of honour and domestic conflicts. While from all these cases, only 75 cases were reported as honour killings in 2014 (Sana, 2019)

Hundreds of women of all ages are murdered in Pakistan for various causes related to multiple conceptions of 'honour' (Jasam, 2001). Ali (2001) associates honour killing with tribal practices, reportedly committing adultery, settling disputes with opponents, marrying without the family's consent, refusing to engage in an arranged marriage, or seeking a divorce. Shah (2007) emphasizes religious misunderstandings that lead to committing such acts. In addition, teasing (*Tano*) by community members, repaying debts, familial or tribal animosity, concealing murder as "honour killings" to get minimal penalty under statutory law, and the deteriorating judicial system are among the reasons (Patel & Gadit, 2008). Murders for the sake of so-called honour are common in Pakistan. However, several areas in Pakistan's Baluchistan province (Bhagnari, Dera Murad Jamali, Bakhtiyar Abad, including other districts of Naseer Abad) are well known for similar crimes. A reasonable estimate places the number of honour killings in Bhagnari at 55 to 60 annually, or around two per month. This crime is known by many regional names in Pakistan, including *Kala-kali* (Punjab), *Karo-Kari* (Sindh), *Tor-Tora* (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa), and *Siyakari* (Baluchistan). In English, the phrase "honour killing" is commonly used to describe such killings in literature and the media. For that reason, this research paper uses the word 'honour killing'.

Due to the under-reporting of such instances, data on honour killing is challenging to collect and unreliable. Thus, there are two significant obstacles to the under-reporting of honour killings; the first is the

unwillingness of victims' family members to come forward, while the second obstacle is that these killings are not recognised as crimes within the social and cultural settings in which they occur (Goldstein, 2002). Honour killings have a high degree of support in Pakistani society and rural communities (Taipi, 2004). Honour killings are shown as suicides or accidents (Hassan, 1999). And there is no government-sponsored mechanism to register and track honour killing (Amnesty International, 1999).

However, according to the studies cited, many such events continue unreported (HRCR, 2013). The statistics in reports are based on media stories and volunteer reports; nevertheless, if the data were rigorously documented independently, the numbers may be far higher (Amnesty International, 1999). According to the National Reconstruction Bureau (2001), each Union Council (the minor administrative level of district administration) must keep a birth, death, and marriage registration. Still, these registers are outdated, and the figures are inaccurate. The cause of death must be recorded in a column in the death register. In most cases, deaths were recorded as natural, regardless of whether they were murders. As a result, official figures are likely to be unreliable.

Research Objectives

Honor killing has gotten insufficient attention in terms of human rights issues. This practice has its roots in history and still prevails in contemporary society, especially in rural peninsulas. Furthermore, honor killing is a problem that both Eastern and Western scholars should investigate because it is a humanitarian issue. The more attention it receives from global audiences, the more collectively a solution for the countries dealing with this issue may be devised. Therefore, the main objectives in this regard are as follows.

- To provide a proper understanding of honor killing as a sort of honor-based human rights violation.
- To examine the primary causes of honor killings.
- To explore the impact of honor killing in Pakistan in general and *Bhagnari* (Baluchistan) in particular.
- To analyze the relationship between Islamic Teachings and honor killing.
- To investigate whether Islam has any connection with honor killing.
- To examine the efforts of law enforcement agencies to combat honor killing.
- To explore the role of feudal lords in influencing the lives of local people and their roles in the Jirga system.
- To explore the relations between honor killing and settling disputes.

- To provide recommendations to combat honor killings

The data was collected using the key phrases *Karo-Kari*, honour killing, honor-murder, honor-based violence, violence against women, and gender-based violence in various combinations in the electronic databases Google, Scholarly-articles, and Organizational reports. Several documents were discovered exploring the nature and scope of gender-based violence in Pakistan. However, only a few empirical studies in Pakistan have looked at the social epidemiology of honour killings, showing the profile of victims and offenders and the reasons for the practice's persistence. Most primary studies in Pakistan have investigated the issue of 'honour killing' as a customary practice, and their analyses have been limited to specific approaches to understanding the course. For example, it is a cultural practice intertwined with tribal, feudal, and patriarchal norms, values, and dominance (Bhatti et al., 2011). It is used as a tool of political manipulation as well. (Khalil & Sheikh, 2010). Shah (2007) examined the topic of honour killings from an economic standpoint, concluding that honour allegations carry severe punishments and that a trade economy thrives within the politics of honour killing. Therefore, it is observed that a man alleged as '*Karo*' must pay a considerable sum to compensate for this conduct, or he will be murdered. Thus, the pretext of honour is used to extract money from the wealthy. One research looked at the issue from the standpoint of public health (Nasrullah, 2009). This research was supported by a brief report published in the Lancet, which included the case of a 30-year-old Pakistani lady who escaped being killed by her family on the excuse of besmirching family honour (Solberg, 2009). A literature review about mental health problems on *Syah-Kari*, a type of 'honor killing' in Pakistan was conducted. Gadit & Patel (2008) suggested that specific measures can be taken by examining the socio-cultural and psychopathological aspects related to the practice of *Karo-Kari*. A paper studied honour killing from an Islamic viewpoint considering the Quran and Hadith (sayings of Prophet Muhammad PBUH), which assert that Islam encourages veiling man and woman's sexual interactions rather than making them public and does not allow for the death of someone in the name of honour (Muhammad, 2012). Additionally, Hussain (2006) conducted a contextual analysis of legislation surrounding honour crimes in Pakistan. He concluded that legislation exists in Pakistan to condemn and acknowledge the severity of violence against women; however, enforcement of laws and comprehensive strategies are required to combat the factors leading to honour crimes. According to the available literature, honour killing is not a penalty for breaking a code of honour; instead, it has been turned into a practice of murdering women for a variety of reasons other than female infidelities, such as gaining recompense, settling a personal conflict, avenging someone, and so on (Gadit & Patel 2008).

Honor Killing and Patriarchy

Honour killing has patriarchal origins and is regarded as one of the most extreme expressions of a patriarchal system (Johnson & Johnson, 2001). According to Bell Hooks, patriarchy is "a socio-political system that asserts that males are essentially dominant and superior to women. He also stated that females are judged weak, and men culturally possess the right to dominate and rule over females and preserve domination by different types of psychological terrorism and violence." As defined by Ahmed et al (2004) patriarchy is a system of ideas and beliefs that rationalize male dominance over females in society. Patriarchal social norms and values relate to conventions and behaviors in the male-dominated familial social organization (Ahmed et al, 2004). Kulwicki (2002) believes that males have control over material and social resources. The patriarchal social systems offer power and authority to male heads of family, community, clan, and tribe (Wasan, 2012). This shows that violence against women is ingrained in larger societal structures, with patriarchy as a fundamental aspect, in which males judge what is acceptable and deviant and whether an action is punishable (Hunnicut, 2009). Men have established several self-serving methods and institutionalized very local norms of behavior for females to defend and maintain this obsolete patriarchal system (Moghadam, 1992). In addition, gender-based arrangements to restrict women's movement, speech, and sexuality, specialized forms of family and kinship, exchange marriages, *Jirga* (conclave), and a powerful ideology relating family honour to female virtue give a justification for killing a female in the pretext of honour. These are all instruments devised and maintained by males to regard women as commodities for their interests (Nusbaum, 1995). As a result, if a woman's behavior or activity is perceived as a danger to the patriarchal system, she is punished, which may include her death.

Many regions of Pakistan, particularly eastern Baluchistan, are heading to backwardness by the superfluous influence of feudal, tribal, and patriarchal traditions that regulate all aspects of women's lives and consider them objects. These ideals frequently express customs, practices, and behaviors; women are viewed as objects, exploited for purposes such as providing money to enemies to settle disputes, sold, purchased, traded, harmed, and killed. This objectification manifests itself further in identifying females with the honour of men, family, and society. In the South Asian region, there is a well-known proverb, *Zan-Zar-Zameen* (women, riches, and land), and it is widely held that a man's honour is linked to these three 'things.' (Azam & Imra 2008). These things may become a source of dispute, and a man can murder or be murdered due to them. Women are put in this triad alongside these two 'things,' wealth and land; women are regarded as objects and associated with riches and land (Chauhan, 2014). In the case of honour killings, the female body is considered an 'artifact' that holds family honour, and when she is thought to pose a danger to that honour, she is punished

with beating, burning, sexual assault, and death (Akbar & Sheikh, 2010).

Feudal Lords and Honor Killings

Many nations have gradually phased out the feudal system, but it persists in Pakistan, notably in Baluchistan, but not in its original form. Feudal lords do not have private armies or collect taxes. Still, they have substantial landholdings, and many personal guards (who can kill or be murdered for them). They rely entirely on their tribe or clan for social, economic, and political support and personal safety (Bhanbhro et al., 2013). As a result, local elites have considerable power in all areas of Baluchistan, particularly eastern Baluchistan, and directly impact all aspects of ordinary people's lives. They also control governing bodies, including law enforcement agencies, district administrations, education, and health (Wassan et al., 2013). Many words for the rural aristocracy (feudal ruler) exist in the native tongue, including *Bhotar*, *Sardar*, *Nawab*, *Sarmachar*, and *Wadero*. The names *wadero* and *Sardar* are the most often used among them. This paper will use these terms: *wadero/wedera* (singular/plural) and *brother/bhotars* (singular/plural). Local elites influence all types of governments, whether democratic or dictatorial; they are a component of the government in one form or another, though more probable in some cultures than others. They are legislators, ministers, and consultants to the government. It is in their best interests to keep the population backward, illiterate, and economically dependent so they can dominate them through official government machinery and private bandits (Bhanbhro et al., 2013). Because of the 'feudal' landlord's vast power base, no one dares to speak out against them for fear of being socially shunned, economically crippled, or terrorized. The unequal distribution of feudal authority and misuse of that power by feudal lords is a primary element supporting honor-related crimes (Talpur et al., 2013).

A local *wadero* has complete control of the local police station. If a poor person's cow is stolen, he will not be allowed to file a first information report (FIR) until the local *wadero* directs the police station. In many situations, local elites have appointed their men to civil administration to maintain control over people's lives (Alavi, 1976). The dominance and authority of feudal lords are supported and enhanced by state institutions and policies. For example, during the previous administration, the Sindh province was divided into private feudal estates and fiefdoms for chosen feudal lords into rural regions and certain political parties in urban areas. The existing districts were divided into two or more halves, such as Jacobabad split into Kashmore, and given over to one or more feudal lords who served as district mayors (Bhutto, 2005).

Jirga System- a Decision-Making Assembly

The *Jirga* system is one of the most critical mechanisms in Baluchistan to maintain honor killings. The *Jirga* is a tribal council or decision-making assembly. Despite the government's prohibition, this is a tribal system of

justice that is actively used in some parts of Pakistan to deal with problems and disputes. These councils are run by local elites and are made up entirely of men, particularly those who are already powerful and have inherited influence within the baradari (shared community) clan or tribe (Hussain, 2006). The *Jirga* is led by a *Sardar* (tribe leader), or a *Wadero* (landlord), and this conclave includes both groups. Each side appoints two or more delegates, known as advisers, to represent them in the *Jirga*. The primary goal of *Jirga* is to restore equilibrium by compensation for damage, not to uncover the truth and punish the guilty. For example, suppose a *Jirga* is convened to determine the case of an honor killing. In that case, the appointed advisers will have previously identified the number of killings or other harm committed by each party and will present them at the *Jirga*. The judges discuss the issues with those advisors in private before publicly announcing the verdict. The *Jirga* views *Karo-Kari* (honor killing) as a legitimate act of the man whose family was dishonored (Participatory Development Initiative, 2005). The *Jirga* ethically and legally supports the man who murders to restore honor and is regarded as a keeper of honor. When the *Jirga* decides on an honor murder case, women who are killed or liberated are not considered victims but the guilty party. To restore his honor, a man must kill the woman he owns (wife, daughter, or sister). He is considered the victim in *Jirga* because he has experienced loss, first to his honor and subsequently to the lady he is forced to kill. Traditionally, both warring parties are obligated to accept the *Jirga*'s decision. A PDI research on the role of tribal *Jirga* in violence against women investigated that in *Karo-Kari* (honor killing), the *Jirga* not only provides a safeguard to abusers but actively encourages them to kill women in the name of honor (Participatory Development Initiative, 2005).

Jirga and Rule of Law

Although the *Jirga* is prohibited in Pakistan, the rule of *Jirga* typically outweighs the rule of law (Asian Human Rights Commission, 2010). The state's stance toward the *Jirga* system has been primarily positive (AI, 1999). When the *Jirga* breaches the right to a fair trial, the Pakistani government fails to defend women's rights. The *Jirga* rejects the right to a fair trial and a victim's right to access a lawyer, a court, and qualified, independent, and unbiased jurists. Powerful feudal lords rule the *Jirga*, most of whom are members of Pakistan's legislation. Thus, the state is unwilling to intervene. The *Jirga* is held mainly in government bodies and local district administrations, with participation from the police. The Pakistani government hosted a *Jirga* with the Afghan government and the Taliban (The National, 2011). The district administration in eastern Baluchistan has been progressively enlisting the help of local elites and the *Jirga* system to handle issues affecting the government, like tribal conflicts, land disputes, and irrigation water disputes, which may have resulted in many deaths in

inter, and intra-tribal feuds (AI, 1999). The regular legal system has been bypassed in this practice because the tribal system delivers speedier, cheaper, and better long-term solutions. On the other hand, this approach has given the idea that the rule of law as embodied in the constitution and statute law is unnecessary and may be replaced by other systems, such as the *Jirga* system.

Methodology

The universe for the research was Bhagnari, and keeping the nature of research in mind, researchers used qualitative design. Its main advantage is that it provides a complete description and analysis of the research project without narrowing the scope of the study or the nature of respondents' responses (Langkos, 2014). However, the results of qualitative research are riskier because they might be perceived as reflecting the opinions of the larger community. The reason is that qualitative research is most appropriate for small samples (Collis & Hussey, 2003). However, for this research, the researchers could not directly interview the victims of honor killings because most of them had been killed or sold. Alternatively, researchers approached the respondents belonging to the same region. A convenient sample of 12 students from Bhagnari studying in different universities in Lahore was established. The researchers conducted the interviews using an interview guide comprised of open-ended questions that let the respondents express their views, prior knowledge, and experience with honor killing. Meetings with respondents were held during the months of July and August (2022). The in-depth interviews took place at the university hostels. During the interviews, the audio recordings and notes were maintained for the analysis of data.

Population and Sampling

The study population was the youth from public and semi-public universities in Lahore. However, the population was further narrowed down and selected students from Bhag Nari (Baluchistan) who were currently studying at the universities of Lahore (GCU, PU, UMT, and UCP). The respondents participating in the study were approached by two male researchers who informed them about the research objectives and explained the interview guide. The researchers of this study selected a sample of 12 students of the same age group (20-29) with social, cultural, political, and regional backgrounds. However, they were assured that their participation was voluntary and that their identity was kept anonymous. After selecting the population, a convenient sampling technique was used for the research. Convenience sampling, also called accidental sampling, is a nonprobability or nonrandom sample in which members of the target population satisfy specific requirements, such as easy accessibility, geographic proximity,

availability at a particular time, or a willingness to participate, are included in the study's purposes. It is also the population the researcher may easily access for study (Etikan, 2016).

Method

A case study approach was used to study the nature of honor killings in Bhagnari. The main advantage of a case study is that it can increase our understanding of human behavior or attitude. A case study aims to provide an accurate and detailed description of the case. Case studies usually include in-depth interviews, a review of respondents' prior experiences, and observation (Ibrahim, 2016). For this research, the data was collected from students with the help of in-depth interviews. The respondents, as they expressed, had observed the cases, and causes of honor killing in their lifetime. The data they provided helped researchers to understand the nature of the socio-cultural background of *Bhagnari*, and the nature of honor killings as well.

Content analysis was used to analyze respondents' data during in-depth interviews. Content analysis allows researchers to organize qualitative data they have gathered to satisfy research objectives. However, researchers risk interpreting the data inaccurately and drawing misleading and unreliable conclusions (Langkos, 2014).

Pre-testing

In September 2008, in Baba Kot, a rural village in Baluchistan's district Jaffar Abad, three teenage girls aged 16-18 tried to convince their parents to marry the men they wanted. But their elders refused to allow them to marry the people they wanted, but two aunts of theirs supported the girls. Later the girls intended to marry in court. When the rumors of their intention spread, Abdul Satar Umrani, the brother of former minister Sadiq Umrani, arrived with his bodyguards, abducted the girls, and drove them to a remote location. After reaching the location they beat the girls and their aunts with the handles of the gun. Later they dug a ditch with the intention to bury the woman alive. All three girls were thrown into the ditch, and their aunts were shot dead. The girls were gravely hurt but alive when they were thrown into a ditch and coated in mud and stones by Abdul Satar and his men. The case is thought to have been hidden due to his family's influence. He was a powerful man and he had links with government officials since his brother was MPA and minister in Baluchistan's government. No one in the region filed FIR against him, and no police intervened. The motive of Abdul Satar was to punish the three young ladies because they had brought shame to the clan since the news of their marriage was spread in other areas of Baluchistan. The suspected individuals are said to be influential in the area and control the lives of ordinary people.

Cultural Setting of the Area

Compared to other developing countries, Pakistan hosts 68 percent of the people living in rural regions in a joint family system, adhering to their ancestors' traditions. Baluchistan mostly made up of the "*Baloch*" tribe with many other minor tribes, is regarded as the most traditional since the inhabitants still live in tribal communities, adhering to centuries-old customs and a unique code of conduct in daily life (Khalil & Sheikh, 2010). The Balochis are patriarchal by nature. They bow to their elders or headmen, the head of the family (*Paro*), the tent or town, the clan, and the tribe. These chiefs are indeed the Baloch society's foremost stewards. They serve as both the military administrator and the head of the judiciary. They have a considerable advantage over their peers and are never challenged in their unrestricted abilities (Global Security, 2011). Their society is stratified and characterized as "feudal militarism".

Women are regarded as the most essential part of their honor code. Women are required to observe a specific code of conduct both within and outside the house and to refrain from specific actions because they are seen to bring "shame" and "dishonor" to the family, which in most cases leads to the death of the suspected woman (Khalil & Sheikh, 2010).

Findings And Analysis

The research findings revealed a wide range of "reasons" and "motives" for the deaths of most women and some males under the name of honor. We have gathered them into the following themes.

Patriarchy and Socio-Cultural Environment

During the research findings, the researchers analyzed the socio-cultural causes of honor killings and explored the potential influence of male-dominated social systems that prevail in rural areas of Baluchistan. Most of the institutions such as family, caste, Baradari, tribe, marriage, and Jirga and patriarchal in nature. Through these institutions, males impose social limitations, and strict gender segregation, promote kinship marriages and establish a connection between family honor and women. Male family members exercise control and authority over their female family members which represents a fundamentally male-dominated family structure. Because male family members commit honor killings against female family members, the family is crucial in the context of honor killing. "Woman is considered honor (*Izat*) of a man and her family (*Khandan*). If she defamed her family, she is punished," a male respondent narrated.

In the social settings of Baluchi society, the power, status, and identity of a man are determined by his caste, *baradari*, or clan. There are various cases in which men and women have been killed under the guise of "honor," when they chose to get married to someone from different castes, *braderis*, or clans, (portrayed in case studies 4 and 9).

Patriarchy and Marriage

Marriage, a social institution, also reflects the community's male-dominated social structure. Endogamy is often practiced by sustaining patrimony or patriarchy in traditional communities of Baluchistan, particularly in Bhagnari. Parallel cousin marriages are performed to preserve endogamy. In case study 4 and 9, it is apparent that the ladies who compromise the custom of endogamous marriage by choosing a free-will marriage is labeled as *Kari* and, in most contexts, killed.

Free will Marriage and Consequences

Amnesty International (2001) highlighted that declaring the desire to choose a bride and marry a partner of one's choice is viewed as a significant act of non-conformity in a culture where most weddings are arranged by parents. Similarly, a respondent narrated that, by expressing her desire to marry the person of her choice, she damages her family's honor, and if she gets married without the consent of her family is often accused of committing adultery (*Zinah*) or being kidnapped and raped. Cases 4 and 9 are portrayal of this custom as both ladies desired to marry the person of their choice. In Case No. 4, Rabia with the help of her mother married her partner without her father's consent. When her father came to know this, he filed an FIR against Abro for kidnapping his daughter. Rabia's mother was supporting her, consequently, she was killed in the name of honor because she had helped her daughter to get married to a man of his choice. In case no 9, Noor ran away with a man with whom she married. Her family filed an FIR and reported that their girl had been kidnapped. They could not find her until, one day, Noor called and talked to her mother. Noor was given assurances that her family had forgiven her, and they want her to visit them. On the way home, Noor was killed by her brothers. A respondent also expressed his view that in Rural Baluchistan, women are deprived of their marriage rights. Most often, marriage is seen as a matter of family authority. If someone violates his/her family norm, he/she faces a social boycott and often gets killed.

Honor Killing and its Impact on Family (Economic Perspective)

Many men appear to be stimulated by a need for money or land to accuse their spouses or other female relatives of defaming their families. Case studies 1, 2, 3, and 11 provide an example of killings based on economic motives. For instance, men accuse their female family members as *Kali* with someone whom they expect to extract money or land. Either a sum of cash is given as "*Khoon Baha*" (blood money), or a woman is presented as recompense (*Aiwaz*) (Lari, 2011).

Respondents expressed their views when they were asked about the cause-and-effect relationship between family and honor killing. Researchers after

hearing the opinions of respondents analyzed that honor killing has a negative impact on the economic life of a family. A respondent emphasized that family is affected if a bread earner is killed as *Karo*. As it is mentioned in case study 6, Iqbal Pahor was the only man in his family who had a job. After his death, his family had no other resources for living. Most often, a family's economic system is affected because a lot of money is spent on legal proceedings. As shown in case study 3, Anwar did not have enough money to bribe *Sardars*, and was unable to get his wife back. The cost of taking legal action is high. More frequently, police are also bribed to end the conflict in silence. Also, to negotiate terms (*Razi Nama*) with a woman's family, a lot of money must be paid. Therefore, the entire life's income is spent in a single settlement.

Politics and Honor Killing

Most women are murdered due to political conflicts between men. Ranging from settling conflicts with opponents to serving personal interests, honor killings have been used as a tool. In case study 2, Shakoor accused his wife as *Kari* with Suleman because Shakoor wanted to seize a disputed land. In case study 10, *Wadero* had a dispute with someone who had given a loan to Ahmed. Ahmed being unable to return the loan, consulted *Wadero* who convinced Ahmed that killing the man would pay the debt. Ahmed accused his wife as *Kari* with the man he borrowed loan from. Killing them both did not provide any profit to Ahmed but served *Wadero's* interest. Case study 4 represent political conflicts between two tribes. Salma was killed by her husband on the accusation of being *Kari* with Abid Abro (leader of *Abro* clan).

Status of Woman

A male participant expressed his opinion as follows: "We (men) have the right to marry more than one wife since we have the greater sexual desire (*shahwat*) than women. A woman should stay at home since her duty is to take care of her family and the household while also serving the husband. A man's duty is to go out and work. Respondent also said, "Because women cannot make better decisions and are prone to error, males can make all decisions, and their decisions must be obeyed ". Another participant narrated that women in rural Baluchistan are frequently denied access to education, healthy nourishment, legal and social rights, and the ability to make deeply personal decisions about marriage and divorce, the extent of their families, and other family-related issues under this male-dominated societal structure. Social norms and traditions have given men power and authority. These actions, including imposing arbitrary borders on women, abusing them, murdering them in the name of honor, making decisions without consulting them, and deciding their future in a *Jirga*, are self-serving strategies developed and spread by males to preserve their position of dominance.

Masculinity and Social Expectation

Manhood may be described in terms of expressions, acts, and behaviors and the function men play in social and gender roles (Wassan, 2012). During interviews, the following characteristics of masculinity emerged: a robust and muscular man, a real man, an authoritative man, a respected and honored man, a sexually potent man, and a man with social and political authority to defend his family, tribe, and village. *Mursmarhu* in Sindhi and *Sarmachaar* in Baluchi are the traditional terms to refer to an ideal man who protects and upholds the honor of his family. A man cannot be a *Mursmarhu* or *Sarmachar* unless he cannot control his ladies. According to this social definition of masculinity, a man is expected to act and show himself differently than a woman, for example, not to cry or weep.

During the interviews, respondents reported some characteristics of *Mursmarhu* or *Sarmachar* as follows: a man who has control over his ladies; a man who guards his honor; a man who can operate a weapon; a man who has murdered someone in the name of honor; and, in some instances, a man who has more than one wife. According to one male respondent, "a person cannot be a man, just a *khadro* (trans) if he does not dominate his ladies." Most notably, the idea of masculinity is one of the social relations and is constantly associated with women. Manliness is translated into action in the context of honor-related violence against women via the use of power, authority, and violence. In many cases, the concept of masculinity is used to justify aggression and control over women. "Being a man, it is our first obligation to guard our honor, and to maintain the honor, and to kill or be killed," a male respondent remarked. A landlord, and student at Punjab university, emphasized this in an interview: "people don't kill their wives for no cause; it's an issue of honor (*Ghairat*) of a man, and it's his obligation as a man to safeguard the honor of his family."

Role of Jirga (Tribal Conclave)

A respondent expressed his views on Jirga's role in an honor killing, "A tribal system still prevails in rural areas of Baluchistan, consequently, tribal leaders and feudal lords continue to hold a lot of authority. They establish their own systems of justice and laws, in which the concept of honor differs from the judicial laws of Pakistan". The role of landowners (*Wadero/Bhotars*), *Jirgas*, and *Panchayat* (conclave of elders of village, tribe, or community) have been emphasized and are supported by various members of the community. According to a respondent, "killing of men or women in the name of honor is not considered as a crime but instead, the killing of accused is the restoration of honor of family, tribe, and *jirga*. Such issues are resolved by *Jirga*, a conclave of *Sardars* and *Waderas*. leaders of *Jirga* and *Panchayat* have a responsibility to punish the accused, but none of their daughters or sons have ever been accused and treated the same as the accused ones. No leader's daughter or son has been accused as

Karo or *Kari* since this custom prevails (Faqir and Atta, 2017). “*Sardars* pose a significant power and control the community’s social life. Having such powers and privileges, *Sardars* sustain a position of social, economic, and political dominance”, a respondent emphasized. Given these privileges, they collaborate with the police to establish and maintain a strong position and to gain political power as well. Thus, all the disputes over land and issues including honor killings are resolved by the local *Panchayat* of *Sardars*. Those who establish ties with them are given favor and those who do not are at loss. In case study 2 Shakoor and in case study 5 Khadim killed their wives, but they had ties with landlords, thus no legal actions were taken against them. *Jirga* presented a verdict in their favor.

Limitations and Recommendations

Bhagnari is a remote district of Baluchistan where no empirical research on honor killing has been conducted before. In this area, the frequency of honor killings is high, compared to other districts of Baluchistan. For this purpose, this study presents only small scoping research which provides stimulating findings. The primary limitation of this research is its nature of a small sample which is also a major limitation of qualitative research. However, choosing a small sample did not provide in-depth findings but it did represent the environments in which honor killings took place. The data was collected only from students but, if opinions from representatives of govt agencies, district administration, landlords, and health professionals had been included, the research findings may have been maximized. In addition, due to the flood in Baluchistan, researchers could not approach elderly men who might have a better understanding of why honor killing occurs. Visiting local government representatives and law enforcement agencies was not possible due to the catastrophe. However, the study's respondents did represent the culture of Bhagnari and revealed the factors fostering honor killing phenomena.

There are several initiatives that should be taken by the government with the cooperation of human rights and other international organizations.

There should be strong legislative policies against honor killings and these activities should not be addressed at the family or *Jirga* level but rather at the state level. To significantly improve the court's justice system and legislation, the abilities of legal professionals involved in the entire operation and decision-making must be upgraded. The legal system may be significantly enhanced if women are given equal opportunities to enter more professional positions at the legislative and legal levels to reduce misogyny. To protect them from threats from their families and society, the victims of honor killings should have protection measures.

To solve the issue of under-reporting, a well-structured system should be implemented at the union council and district levels. The data should be an

evidence-based management system to accurately reflect the primary factors that led to the victim's death and injuries to depict the primary factors that led to the victim's death and injuries; the data should be an evidence-based management system. The victim's or the victim's family member's name should be kept anonymous for the public to prevent a potentially dangerous circumstance. This will allow the victim's family and the victim to discuss their incident confidently.

The training with the most recent instruments and methods for accurately measuring the incidence rate should be given to community workers participating in awareness sessions by various social organizations. They should be included in any new interventions designed to address the issue of honor killing because they can contribute evidence-based knowledge to address the community's primary concerns and impediments.

Conclusion

During the research analysis of case studies and literature review, it was revealed that honor killings were not only encouraged by local customs and traditions but also by feudal structures, norms imposed by masculinity, and the misuse of state institutions and law enforcement agencies. These are the factors that support the continuation of violence against women, especially in terms of honor killing. Feudal lords and governmental institutions, particularly the police, also contribute by playing key actors in cases of honor killings. These influential parties provided strong support and freedom from punishment to those who committed murders in the name of honor. To prevent legal actions and punishment, the pretexts of culture, honor, and religion are deployed as self-serving bulwarks.

In Addition, the finding also revealed that honor killings are one of the most glaring examples of a patriarchal, feudal, and tribal mindset that, unexpectedly, is common among rural people in Baluchistan, where literacy is compromised. Tribal and traditional authority structure has an impact on the entire community, especially in terms of equal rights. This tribal ideology views honor killing as a legitimate response by the male family member whose family was dishonored rather than a crime. This attitude was learned via family, community, and culture and is ingrained in society's social and cultural structure. The same tribal chiefs and feudal lords are political representatives in the Pakistani Parliament and National and Provincial Assemblies; therefore, they support and defend it.

Jirga System has a significant impact on decision-making in rural Baluchistan. Although it is unlawful. According to literature Jirga system is a feudal or tribal system made up of male community members actively employed in Pakistan to settle legal disputes. Supporting and shielding the male victim is an essential factor in the longevity of the honor killing problem. This system is one of the key factors contributing to the increase in honor killings in Bhagnari. As apparent in the case of studies, the tribal

judicial system tends to encourage murderers by compensating them with money, women, or both rather than delivering justice to victims or punishing murderers.

However, the findings of our research are coherent with those of in literature review, which showed that institutions, in particular the police, are reluctant to take action against honor- related crimes, due to involvement of influential people of the particular area, and that the law contains many weaknesses that allow those who murder in the name of honor to escape punishment.

References

1. Amnesty International. (1999). *Pakistan: Violence against women in the name of honor*.
2. Retrieved from <http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset>.
3. Amnesty International, (1999). *Pakistan: honor killings of girls and women*. Retrieved from <http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/info/1999>.
4. Asian Human Rights Commission. (2010). Gender-based disparities are the worst in Pakistan.
5. *Ethics Understanding patriarchy*. Retrieved from <http://imagineborders.org/pdf/zines/UnderstandingPatriarchy.pdf>.
6. Collis, J., Hussey, R. (2022). *Business Research: A Practical Guide for Undergraduate and Postgraduate Students* (4th ed.). Palgrave MacMillan.
7. Etikan, I. (2016). Comparison of Convenience Sampling and Purposive Sampling. *American Journal of Theoretical and Applied Statistics*, 5(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.11648/j.ajtas.20160501.11>
8. Fisk, R., (2010). The Crime Wave that Shames the World. *The Independent*. Retrieved from <http://www.independent.co.uk/opinion/commentators/fisk/.html>.
9. HRCF, (2012). *State of Human Rights in 2011*. Retrieved from <http://www.hrcpweb.org/pdf/>
10. HRCF, (2013). *State of human rights in 2012*. Retrieved from <http://hrcpweb.org/hrcpweb/wp-content/pdf/AR2012.pdf>
11. Ibrahim, M. (2016). Types of Qualitative Research: *Data collection techniques*. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/299532851_Types_of_Qualitative_Research

12. Khalil, & Sheikh, (2010). Political manipulation in human rights violations: A case of honor killings in Baluchistan, Pakistan. *Pakistaniaat; A Journal of Pakistan Studies*, 2(2): 36-43.
13. Langkos, S. (2014). Research methodology: *Data collection method and Research tools*.
14. Doi:10.13140/2.1.3023.1369.
15. Malik, N., I. Saleem and I. Hamdani. (2001). Karo Kari, Tortora, siyahkari, kala kali: *There is no honor in killing*. National Seminar Report, May 25; Lahore, Pakistan.
16. Mayell, H., (2002). Thousands of women were killed for family "honor". *National geographic news*. Retrieved from
17. http://news.nationalgeographic.co.uk/news/2002/02/0212_020212_honorkilling.
18. Patel, S. and A. Gadit, (2008). Karo-Kari: *A form of honor killing in Pakistan*. *Transcultural psychiatry*, 45(4): 683-694.
19. PDI, (2005). Role of a tribal jirga in violence against women: *A case study of Karo Kari in Sindh*. Retrieved from <http://www.wluml.org/node/7342>
20. Thomson Reuters Foundation Trust, (2011). The world's five most dangerous countries for women. Retrieved from
21. <http://www.trust.org/documents/womensights/resources/2011WomenPollResults.pdf>.
22. Thomson Reuters; Foundation Trust, (2011). The world's five most dangerous countries for women. Retrieved from
23. <http://www.trust.org/documents/womensights/resources/2011WomenPollResults.pdf>.
24. United Nations Population Fund, (2000). *The state of the world's population, chapter 3*.
25. Available from <http://web.unfpa.org/swp/2000>.
26. ActionAid, (2012). The description of honour. Retrieved from <http://www.actionaid.org.uk/720/pakistan.html>.
27. Aftab, T., S. Rehman and Z. Saeed, (2008). Living under the axe: *Story narrated by karo kari survivor*. *Pakistan Journal of Women's Studies: Alam-e-Niswan*, 15(1): 85- 96.
28. Ahmed, F., S. Riaz, P. Barata and D.E. Stewart, (2004). Patriarchal beliefs and perceptions of abuse among south Asian immigrant women. *Violence against Women*, 10(3): 262- 282.

29. Amnesty International, (1999). Pakistan: *honour killings of girls and women*. Available from <http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/info/1999>.
30. Alavi, H., (1976). The rural elite and agricultural development in Pakistan. *Pakistan Economic and Social Review*, 14(1/4): 173-210.
31. Malik, N., I. Saleem and I. Hamdani. (2001). Karo Kari, Tortora, siyahkari, kala kali: *There is no honor in killing*. National Seminar Report, May 25; Lahore, Pakistan.
32. Mayell, H., (2002). Thousands of women were killed for family "honor". *National geographic news*. Retrieved from
33. http://news.nationalgeographic.co.uk/news/2002/02/0212_020212_honorkilling.
34. Patel, S. and A. Gadit, (2008). Karo-Kari: *A form of honor killing in Pakistan*. *Transcultural psychiatry*, 45(4): 683-694.
35. PDI, (2005). Role of a tribal jirga in violence against women: *A case study of Karo Kari in Sindh*. Retrieved from <http://www.wluml.org/node/7342>
36. Thomson Reuters Foundation Trust, (2011). The world's five most dangerous countries for women. Retrieved from
37. <http://www.trust.org/documents/womensights/resources/2011WomenPollResults.pdf>.
38. Thomson Reuters; Foundation Trust, (2011). The world's five most dangerous countries for women. Retrieved from
39. <http://www.trust.org/documents/womensights/resources/2011WomenPollResults.pdf>.
40. United Nations Population Fund, (2000). *The state of the world's population, chapter 3*.
41. Available from <http://web.unfpa.org/swp/2000>.
42. ActionAid, (2012). The description of honour. Retrieved from <http://www.actionaid.org.uk/720/pakistan.html>.
43. Aftab, T., S. Rehman and Z. Saeed, (2008). Living under the axe: *Story narrated by karo kari survivor*. *Pakistan Journal of Women's Studies: Alam-e-Niswan*, 15(1): 85- 96.
44. Ahmed, F., S. Riaz, P. Barata and D.E. Stewart, (2004). Patriarchal beliefs and perceptions of abuse among south Asian immigrant women. *Violence against Women*, 10(3): 262- 282.

45. Amnesty International, (1999). Pakistan: *honour killings of girls and women*. Available from <http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/info/1999>.
46. Alavi, H., (1976). The rural elite and agricultural development in Pakistan. *Pakistan Economic and Social Review*, 14(1/4): 173-210.
47. Ali, R., (2001). The dark side of 'honour', women victims in Pakistan. Lahore: *Shrikat Gah Women Resource Centre Pakistan*.
48. Bhatti, N., M.B. Jamali, N.N. Phulpoto, T. Mehmood and F.M. Shaikh, (2011). Domestic violence against women: *A case study of district jacobabad, sindh Pakistan*. *Asian Social Science*, 7(12): 146-162.
49. Bhutto, A., (2005). Political feudalism in Sindh. *Dawn*.
50. Fisk, R., (2010). Robert fisk: *The crime wave that shames the world*. The independent. Available from <http://www.independent.co.uk/opinion/commentators/fisk/.html>.
51. Geertz, C., (1973). The interpretation of cultures. New York: *Basic Books*. *International Journal of Asian Social Science*, 2013, 3(7):1467-1484 1482.
52. Ghousoub, M., (1987). Feminism or the eternal masculine in the Arab world. *New Left Review* 161.
53. Glaser, B.G. and A.L. Strauss, (1967). The discovery of grounded theory. Chicago: *Aldine*.
54. Goldstein, M.A., (2002). The biological roots of heat-of-passion crimes and honour killings.
55. *Politics and the Life Science*, 21(2): 28-37.
56. Government of Pakistan, (2009). Pakistan economic survey 2007-08. Islamabad: *Ministry of Finance*.
57. Hassan, Y., (1999). The fate of Pakistani women. *The New York Times*. Available from <http://www.nytimes.com/1999/03/25/opinion/>.
58. HRCP, (2012). State of human rights in 2011. Available from <http://www.hrcpweb.org/pdf/>.
59. HRCP, (2013). State of human rights in 2012. Available from <http://hrcpweb.org/hrcpweb/wp-content/pdf/AR2012.pdf>.
60. Hunnicutt, G., (2009). Varieties of patriarchy and violence against women: *Resurrecting "patriarchy" as a theoretical tool*. *Violence Against Women*, 15(5): 553-573.

61. Hussain, M., (2006). Take my riches, give me justice: A contextual analysis of Pakistan's honour crimes legislation. *Harvard Journal of Law & Gender*, 29(1): 223-246.
62. Jackson, R. and E.M. Nesbitt, (1993). Hindu children in Britain. Stoke on Trent: *Trentham*.
63. Jasam, S., (2001). Honour shame and resistance. Lahore: *ASR Publications*.
64. Johnson, P. and J. Johnson, (2001). The oppression of women in India. *Violence against Women*, 7(9): 1051-1068.
65. Kapadia, M.Z., S. Saleem and M.S. Karim, (2010). The hidden figure: *Sexual intimate partner violence among Pakistani women*. *European Journal of Public Health*, 20(2): 164-168.
66. Kulwicki, A.D., (2002). The practice of honor crimes: *A glimpse of domestic violence in the Arab world*. *Issues in Mental Health Nursing*, 23(1): 77-87.
67. Lari, M.Z., (2011). Honour killings in pakistan and compliance of law. Lahore: *Aurat Publication and Information Service Foundation*.
68. Mann, M., (1986). A crisis in stratification theory? Persons, households/families/lineages, genders, classes and nations. *Gender and Stratification*. London: Polity Press.
69. Mayell, H., (2002). Thousands of women killed for family "honour". *National geographic news*. Available from http://news.nationalgeographic.co.uk/news/2002/02/0212_020212_honorkilling.ht
70. McDowell, R., (2008). Women buried alive in 'honour' killings, internet, the associated press. Available from <http://www.thestar.com/news/world/article/488145>
71. Moghadam, V.M., (1992). Patriarchy and the politics of gender in modernising societies:
72. *Iran, Pakistan and Afghanistan*. *International Sociology*, 7(1): 35-53.
73. Muhammad, N., M.M. Ahmed, A. Abdullah, F. Omer and N.H. Shah, (2012). Honour killing in pakistan: *An islamic perspective*. *Asian Social Science*, 8(10): 180-185.
74. Nasrullah, M., S. Haqqi and K. Cummings, (2009). The epidemiological patterns of honour killing of women in Pakistan. *European Journal of Public Health*, 19(2): 193-197.
75. National Reconstruction Bureau, (2001). *The local government system 2001*. Available from http://www.nrb.gov.pk/local_government/.

-
76. Nussbaum, M.C., (1995). Objectification. *Philosophy & Public Affairs*, 24(4): 249-291.
77. Orlikowski, W.J. and J.J. Baroudi, (1991). Studying information technology in organizations:
78. *Research approaches and assumptions*. *Information Systems Research*, 2(1): 1-8.
79. Patel, S. and A. Gadit, (2008). Karo-kari: *A form of honour killing in Pakistan*. *Transcultural psychiatry*, 45(4): 683-694.